

**Town of New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission Meeting**  
**Wednesday March 16<sup>th</sup> 2016 7:00PM - 9:00PM at the Community Center**

Commissioners attending: John Orfitelli (Chair), Helen Christie (Vice Chair), Caryn Sobel, Dawn Elliot, and Julie DeMark

Also in attendance:

Stacy Delarede, Town Building Inspector  
Neal Tomann, Project Engineer for Glynwood  
Ben Crockett, Glynwood Project

**Agenda**

1. Public Comment
2. Mohonk Foothills Project CoA Update
3. Glynwood Barn CoA
4. HPC Inspection of the Red 'Studley' Barn
5. South Putt Burial Ground
6. Foothills Historic District Designation
7. Historic Preservation Master Plan
8. Review/Approve Minutes from January 2016
9. Other
  - Town of New Paltz HPC Code of Ethics
  - Ohioville Historic District
  - File Clean-up

**Minutes**

Meeting was called to order at 7:00pm by motion from Susan DeMark, seconded by Caryn Sobel, motion carried.

1. **Public Comment:** No public comments.
2. **Mohonk Foothills Project CoA Update:** John Orfitelli provided the following letter to Mike Calimano and the Planning Board to summarize the results of the HPC Public Hearing held on January 20<sup>th</sup>.

*Dear Mr. Calimano and Members of the Planning Board,*

*The Town of New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission held a Public Hearing on January 20<sup>th</sup>, 2016 for the Certificate of Appropriateness Application submitted by Mohonk Preserve Inc. regarding Site Plan Improvements to the Mohonk Testimonial Gateway Property (aka Foothills Project), a Locally Designated Historic Landmark, located on Gate House Road in New Paltz pursuant to Zoning Article XIV 140-122 of the New Paltz Code.*

*The following is a summary of the concerns raised by the Commission and consultant Neil Larson, of Larson Fisher Associates, the response from Barton and Loguidice, contractors for Mohonk Preserve, and the general conclusion by the Commission for each of the proposed actions.*

**A. Testimonial Gateway**

1. **Concern:** *Addition of a parking area for up to 90 cars with spaces for school busses or recreational vehicles, location of Services, and potential adverse visual impact. The potential adverse visual impacts the proposed parking area will have on the Testimonial Gateway are not adequately mitigated in the plans provided. The applicant should be requested to shift the congregating area and visitor services to one side or the other of the proposed site and out of direct view of the historic building. This may result in some re-routing of the pathways leading to*

the Old Gatehouse Road. A more detailed plan for enhancing the buffer screening the parking area from the building is needed with a strategy for preventing trailblazing.

**Response:** The Preserve will mitigate these identified impacts by shifting the facilities to the east side of the reception space including the vaulted toilet. In addition, to more effectively screen views of the reception area from the gate house, the Preserve has shifted the western trail connection south and added appropriate vegetative screening towards the north so as to direct visitors to the trail entrances to Lenape Lane which provide more appropriate initial viewing vistas of the historic gatehouse. We believe the Preserve's revised site and planting design will ensure that any adverse visual impacts on the Testimonial Gateway are adequately mitigated. (See Revised Plan Sheet G 1.1).

**Conclusion:** Mohonk Preserve has adequately addressed the concerns of the Commission and approves the plans submitted by Barton and Loguidice included as attachments to the CoA Application.

2. **Concern:** Paving of the pin oak allée should preserve the historic integrity of the feature. A pervious surface, preferably a gravel with bluestone content, was recommended in earlier discussions.

**Response:** The surface of Lenape Lane will be restored consistent with the historic surfacing along the oak allée. The Preserve intends to utilize the proposed gravel surfacing and routine maintenance recommended in the "Restoration and Maintenance Manual for the Shawangunk Carriage Road Systems" (Manual) as adopted by the Mohonk Mountain House, Mohonk Preserve, and Minnewaska State Park Preserve. Flexibility inherent in the design of the top course of the surface allows adjustments in the composition of the aggregates to comply with historic integrity of the surface. A wearing surface of crushed stone is proposed for the resurfacing of portions of Lenape Lane and that portion of the historic Wawarsing Turnpike that will continue to be used for auto travel.

**Conclusion:** Mohonk Preserve has adequately addressed the concerns of the Commission and approves the plans submitted by Barton and Loguidice included as attachments to the CoA Application.

3. **Concern:** Ponds on the property have returned to a natural state in recent decades and were used for nature education classes in the 1960s. The ponds should be maintained for their current ecological conditions. Pond-edge trails, as recommended in the Mohonk Preserve LAMP document (p. 103) are suggested.

**Response:** There are no improvements to the ponds proposed as part of the Foothills project. The phenology and nature discovery trail will be established with minimal disturbance and will be primarily a footpath through the upland wooded areas adjacent to the ponds. The majority of the associated trail improvement will be pruning of existing vegetation to create safe vertical clearances for the trail. In areas where wetlands will need to be crossed to provide continuity in the trail system, the 'Phenology Trail' detail shown on sheet G 5.4 will be used. Restoration of the ponds for improvement of pond ecology or for other habitat conservation purposes could be considered in the future as a separate action.

**Conclusion:** Mohonk Preserve has adequately addressed the concerns of the Commission and approves the plans submitted by Barton and Loguidice included as attachments to the CoA Application.

## **B. Wawarsing Turnpike**

1. **Concern:** Widening the road and conversion of the road from a driveway to an access road will have a potential adverse impact as will the proposal to construct a 10-ft.-wide "dry swale" along the easterly side of the roadway. Every effort should be made to preserve the historic road

materials and roadside features to mitigate the potential adverse impacts of the road widening. An alternative to the proposed paving is needed, as well as more detailed plans for the preservation of the roadside. The portion of the roadway proposed to be bypassed by a new entry from Rt.299 should be preserved as-is rather than "reclaimed as upland meadow."

**Response:** The (Preserve) believes the concerns for impacts along the historic New Paltz & Wawarsing Turnpike can be addressed in part by clarifying the design intent which is to minimally widen the existing roadway by 2-3'. Using historical aerial photographs, we were able to determine that the existing gravel surface limits approaching Hasbrouck House vary in width from about 17' to 18'. To provide for safe two-way passage of vehicles that will access the conservation educational facilities at Hasbrouck House, the drive is proposed to be restored to 20 feet in width, its width when it was a two-lane auto road until 1945.

The surface of this section of the historic Turnpike will be restored consistent with the Shawangunk Carriage Road Systems Manual discussed in our response to the surfacing of the Oak Allée, above. The 10' wide dry swale is intended to address the storm water pollution prevention needs of the project and once constructed will be planted with the appropriate meadow plantings, thus restoring a consistent agricultural meadow appearance to the new edge of the roadway.

The Preserve is confident that the finished surface of the pavement and the plantings of the 'dry swale' will preserve the overall historic appearance of the restored New Paltz & Wawarsing Turnpike. In addition, as an additional mitigation measure the Preserve will preserve the remnant section of the New Paltz & Wawarsing Turnpike for pedestrians, bicyclists, and equestrians in as close to its current state as possible as a mowed agricultural foot trail. In addition, along this section, the Preserve will voluntarily add interpretive signage at this last remaining intact portion of the Turnpike at this trailhead which will provide historic information about the history of the New Paltz & Wawarsing Turnpike. As noted above, by retaining the remainder of the Turnpike preserved in its current state as a mowed agricultural foot trail, it will provide a more natural experience for visitors.

**Conclusion:** Mohonk Preserve has adequately addressed the concerns of the Commission and approves the plans submitted by Barton and Loguidice included as attachments to the CoA Application.

2. **Concern:** Construction of a "new vehicle turnaround" at the northeasterly end of the Wawarsing Turnpike will also have a potential adverse impact on the integrity of the historic roadway. The need for the "turnaround" should be reconsidered. Removing it and preserving the scale, materials and roadside characteristics would eliminate the need to mitigate this potential adverse impact. In addition, the "turnaround" is of a scale and design that have a potential adverse impact on the historic landscape. The parking area and access roads have a potential adverse impact to the landscape and meadow with associations to the Foothills' agricultural heritage.

**Response:** The Preserve recognizes the concerns of the HPC regarding the proposed turnaround, however, the need for this facility arose in response to meetings with neighboring residents who requested that Foothills parking be dispersed and not concentrated at the Testimonial Gateway site. The Preserve has revised the proposed design in response to the Historic Preservation Commission's concerns, including changes in surfacing, the inclusion of additional screening plant materials, reorientation of the facilities and other alternatives to help further mitigate the visual impact of the turnaround.

The new vehicle turnaround discussed in the second part of this comment will be surfaced with a system that is compliant with the Shawangunk Carriage Road Systems Manual. We have further revised the site plan to integrate the turnaround with the proposed parking area to be more respectful of the history of the New Paltz & Wawarsing Turnpike by creating a single entrance drive off the Turnpike (See Revised Plan Sheet G 2.2). Rather than appearing to be a termination or interruption of the Turnpike, the historic Turnpike alignment will be the visually dominant feature under this realignment and the thru-integrity of the Turnpike will be preserved.

*In addition, the Preserve will provide an interpretive panel along the Turnpike that will provide historical information about the origins of the old Turnpike. The surface of the turnaround and parking facilities will be in compliance with the same standards that will be used for the Turnpike restoration.*

*The alternative alignment suggested for the entrance drive to the northeast proposed by the HPC was evaluated by the Preserve. The resulting realignment and new roadway would necessitate a new intersection with Route 299 that would be located in a steep embankment along the shoulder of Route 299. Thus, creating a safe access point there would require regrading and tree removal to provide a clear sight triangle (30' x 30') for exiting traffic, and as a result could have an additional adverse visual impact. It is submitted that the current plans maintain the 'status quo' of the Wawarsing Turnpike and the house from a historical and aesthetic perspective.*

**Conclusion:** Mohonk Preserve has adequately addressed the concerns of the Commission and approves the plans submitted by Barton and Loguidice included as attachments to the CoA Application.

### **General Conclusion**

*As presented, the Mohonk Preserve Foothills Project has been carefully planned to avoid potential adverse impacts to historic resources within the Lake Mohonk Mountain House National Historic Landmark District and in particular the Mohonk Testimonial Gateway Property, a Locally Designated Historic Landmark.*

*The Commission finds the plan changes made in response to our concerns adequately mitigate any potential impacts cited by the Consultant, Commission, and the Public and thereby approves the plans submitted by Barton and Loguidice presented at our meeting on January 20<sup>th</sup>.*

John Orfitelli requested a Decision document be drafted by George Lithco for review at our next meeting pending sign off from the Planning Board on SEQRA.

3. **Glynwood Barn CoA:** Neal Tomann, Property Director and Project Engineer for Glynwood and Ben Crockett presented a CoA Application for a new 6000 sqft livestock boarding barn located on the property owned by the Open Space Institute (OSI). The design is based on a traditional German style bank barn and will be placed on the same spot as the barn that burned down in 1935. The post and beam construction is comprised of materials that are pest resistant with pattern 105 skip lap red siding of southern yellow pine and standing steel galvanized green roofing and white trim. Materials in the structure have been selected to satisfy bio-security protocols put in place for animal welfare. The working farm is planned to include a kiosk with historical description and QR code to link to additional materials. Neal Tomann agreed to the following timeline for completing the public hearing process and CoA Application.

## **Public Hearing Plan for Glynwood Farms CoA Application**

**Date of Public Hearing: 5/18/2016**

<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Date</b>
<b>Publish Public Hearing Notice</b>		
• Create Text	Commissioner	4/27

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Email Text to Applicant</li> <li>Email Text to Town Clerk</li> <li>Submit to Ulster Publishing</li> <li>Publish in New Paltz Times</li> <li>Send Invoice from Ulster Pub to Applicant</li> </ul>	Commissioner Commissioner Town Clerk Ulster Publishing Town Clerk	4/27 4/27 5/2 May 5th Edition
<b>Provide Hard Copy</b> of CoA Application with Supporting Materials to HPC, Town Clerk, and Building Inspector	Applicant	5/5
<b>Provide Digital Copy</b> of CoA Application with Supporting Materials to HPC	Applicant	5/3
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Publish to HPC Web Site</li> </ul>	Commissioner	5/5
<b>Post Signs of Pending Action</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Obtain Signs from Printer per Town Specifications</li> </ul>	Applicant	4/28
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Post Signs on 4 Sides of Property</li> </ul>	Applicant	5/5
<b>Send Abutter Notifications</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Request Address List of Abutting Property Owners from Town Assessor</li> </ul>	Applicant	4/21
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mail Notification of CoA and Public Hearing Notice</li> </ul>	Applicant	5/2
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Obtain notarized affidavit of mailing</li> </ul>	Applicant	5/2

John Orfitelli requested historic marker be placed at the entrance of the property with QR code. Also, detailed materials specifications should be provided with plans and drawings.

A motion to proceed with a public hearing for May 18<sup>th</sup> as outlined above was made by Susan DeMark and seconded by Caryn Sobel. Motion passed.

4. **HPC Inspection of the Red 'Studley' Barn:** Press interest (no public response to HPC) in the Studley barn on Butternut Road led to a site visit by Caryn Sobel and John Orfitelli with Peter Karis, Capital Projects & Design Manager, of OSI on 3 February 2016 to inspect the barn condition and discuss the options under consideration by OSI. Prior to the meeting, Caryn Sobel verified that the property is not located within the boundaries of the Mohonk Preserve (a National Register Historic Site) and therefore a CoA is not required to be submitted by OSI.

The barn appeared sturdy and square from the exterior, but marked swaying and structural irregularities were noticeable from the interior, including offset gaps between the barn framing and the concrete foundation, and large full-thickness cracks in both ends of the foundation.

Although the barn is estimated by NYS to be a century old, the framing and most timbers are recent dimensional lumber, and the siding is novelty siding, replaced from the 1950s-1980s, per OSI realty documentation. The barn is a traditional and common bank barn design.

The property is privately owned. Outreach into the community elicited no responses, even to press articles, claiming an historic interest sufficient to unilaterally designate the structure an historic landmark. The bulk of the community activity the barn was used for was private activity.

In consideration of the value of the property as an agricultural historic landscape, recommendations were made to OSI to replace the barn with a structure that would resemble the barn as much as possible. The HPC also recommended the older timbers in the barn (there has been no dating of these) be salvaged and used onsite in the Mohonk Foothills projects. Peter Karis was receptive to these recommendations and told us the currently favored design in the ongoing architectural design competition for the barn's replacement was a barnlike house that was styled to resemble the Studley barn.

The decision was made not to unilaterally designate the barn. Town officials agreed with the HPC decision.

The following summary from an email to Tonda Highley, Judy Baumann, Linda Menrad, and Don & Kathleen Kachmor from Peter Karis dated 2/22/2016 provides an overview of the evaluation completed by OSI and actions under consideration. The text is presented with permission Peter Karis.

*As you'll recall from my December update, I shared with you the main findings from a structural engineering analysis that concluded that the existing barn was failing and unsafe for occupancy. Since December, we have continued our due diligence on the structure and the surrounding property and sought help determining the potential historic character of the existing barn. We met with the Town Building Inspector who confirmed that the barn is not listed on any federal, state or local historic registries. Representatives from the Town of New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission have also toured the property and the barn interior.*

*Over the past 2 months we have been considering three options outlined below:*

*The first path is to 'do nothing.' This would entail ceasing use of the barn and doing nothing to address the structural issues identified by our structural engineer. Essentially, we would close the property down and install adequate no-trespassing and other warning postings about the instability of the structure and hope that people would respond to the warning. However, it has become abundantly clear that staff and public safety concerns, and our own need for a structure disqualify this as a practical option for OSI.*

*The second path is to do an extensive stabilization of the barn. As we near the end of our due diligence work, we now understand, in detail, the underlying structural issues of the barn and the available stabilization methods. The barn has building system failures of every kind; from foundation and wood superstructure to framing and electrical. The stabilization effort that would be necessary to make the existing barn sound again would be both substantial and indeterminately costly. Ultimately, at the end of this effort, the remaining structure's original design for hay and livestock storage would not meet OSI's needs.*

*The third path is to replace the barn with a similar, smaller, structure with greater functionality. This approach has become OSI's preferred and most practical path. It is our intention to demolish the existing failing barn (salvaging for re-use any and all of its components) and replace it with a new structure. In support of our ongoing work in New Paltz and along the Shawangunk Ridge, the new structure would contain a 2-bedroom single family residence for an OSI caretaker and occasional overnight guests, including employees, trustees and partners. The new structure will be similar in appearance to the existing barn, though smaller in size. It will be private and not rented in any capacity nor be open to the public.*

*The residence will also contain a farm garage and workshop to house equipment associated with property maintenance (i.e. tractor, mowers, tools, etc.) to allow OSI to manage our almost 400 acres of agricultural land between Butternut Road and the Village of New Paltz. Our anticipated use level of the Studley property will be similar to what you have experienced since our taking ownership of the property.*

*When we purchased the property, it had been OSI's intention to adapt and reuse the Red Barn and we have earnestly explored every practical path toward that outcome. We were very disappointed to learn of the structural condition of the barn and have concluded that its adaptive reuse is simply not a viable option for us.*

*As always, we appreciate our ongoing dialogue and are available to answer any questions you may have about our reviews and plans for the property.*

Peter Karis agreed to provide periodic updates and plans to the Commission.

5. **South Putt Burial Ground:** John Orfitelli recently provided Josephine Bloodgood, Interim Executive Director and Curator, with a copy of the letter of intent dated 12/28/2009 from Hampton Inn owner Jay Modhwadiya, in which he committed to a number of items aimed at restoration of the HHS Burial grounds adjacent to the new Hampton Inn currently under construction on South Putt Corners Road. Josephine responded with the following:

*I just went over this with our Site Supervisor Renzo Cinti. He will drive over to take a look at the cemetery to see if the work mentioned in the letter of intent has been taken care of.*

*Renzo just joined the staff last summer, so like me, he's new to this topic. Corey Greener, his assistant, has been here a bit longer and he said the cemetery had been transferred to the Town and that we were no longer responsible for it. He may have this wrong, but do you know anything about that? I'm assuming there's some confusion on his part since the cemetery is included on our list of properties for insurance.*

Dawn Elliott was aware of a very old State law which declared that the local municipality is responsible for maintaining burial grounds. Caryn Sobel agreed to review the Designation materials and check the Town records and clarify the ownership.

Stacy Delarede reported that the wall has been rebuilt and commented on the excellent quality of the workmanship.

6. **Foothills Historic District Designation:** The Commission discussed designating the entire Mohonk Foothills property as a local historic district. Stacy Delarede questioned why a designation would be necessary if the property was already listed in the National Register of Historic Places and, according to the Town Code, a CoA is required for any changes. John Orfitelli agreed that while properties within the Foothills are protected, a local historic district designation, while somewhat redundant, would insure compliance and offers the additional benefit of making available State funds for preservation and restoration which are limited to only those properties located in historic districts. Furthermore, since Mohonk Preserve has indicated willingness to move forward with the historic

district, the process would not be contentious and serve as an excellent template for future district designations such as Ohioville.

7. **Historic Preservation Master Plan:** The Commission was made aware of a joint Town-Village Master Plan committee which did not include representation from either Town or Village HPCs. This is very disconcerting and needs to be addressed. John Orfitelli learned that he inadvertently omitted our Town Board liaison, Julie Seyfert-Lillis, from HPC email distribution.. her email was added immediately.. John Orfitelli agreed to reach out to Julie to provide an overview of our efforts and request that she attend our next meeting in April to share her experience to date and how she envisions the role of both the Town and Village HPC in the process.

The Commission will continue to collaborate with the Village HPC to formulate a Historic Preservation Master Plan. A good goal would be for a presentation by both HPCs at a joint Town-Village board meeting in the Fall and submission of a grant proposal in 1Q2017 to support our initiative.

The Commission reviewed the importance of incentives in the HP Master Plan. John Orfitelli highlighted the excellent research by Caryn Sobel on incentives. A number of documents have been posted to Dropbox for review by the Commission.

Susan DeMark sighted a recent case in western Pennsylvania where a 100 year old church was destroyed to make way for a CVS. Stacy Delarede pointed out that while a Town can not 'zone out' corporations, it can crate zoning for 'use'. It was suggested that an architectural review board might also be needed for the Village and Town to augment our preservation efforts.

8. **Review/Approve Minutes from January 2016:** Due time constraints, the January minutes will be reviewed and approved at our meeting in April.

9. **Other**

- **Town of New Paltz HPC Code of Ethics:** The Code of Ethics document was signed by all members of the Commission. John Orfitelli agreed to post the document on our website.
- **Ohioville Historic District:** An Historic district for Ohioville would highlight the cultural, as well as, historic aspects of the area and bring access to State funds to property owners for restoration. The Commission recognized that the process would require a significant outreach effort to the home owners within the community and likely require tax incentives as discussed in our Master Plan initiative. Stacy Delarede sufuggested an 'overlay' district be created similar to what is done to accommodate multiple uses such as Light Industrial and Residential.
- **File Clean-up:** Helen Christie is ordering file organizers and related materials to facilitate clean-up of our HPC records and files. Stacy Delarede stated that there is a records retention guide for the Town.

Motion to adjourn was made by Dawn Elliott, seconded by Susan DeMark. Motion carried. Meeting adjourned at 9:30pm.